

Indonesian Journal of



Adult and Community Education

Journal homepage: https://ejournal.upi.edu/index.php/IJACE/index

Management of Equality Package Teaching Staff in PKBM Global Mandiri

Citra Setya Rahmansyah¹, Restu Dyah Sulistyaningrum², Daddy Darmawan³, Retno DwiLestari⁴ Community Education, Jakarta State University, Jakarta Indonesia *Correspondence: E-mail: <u>citra 1104622048@mhs.unj.ac.id</u>

ABSTRACT

Non-formal education units through equivalency programs are an effort to provide justice for the entire community. In its implementation, the role of teaching staff is certainly very influential on the quality of delivery of knowledge and knowledge to students. Therefore, it is important to manage the teaching staff. This study aims to examine how the process of managing human resources, namely teaching staff at PKBMGlobal Mandiri. This research uses qualitative methods with data collection techniquesof interviews and documentation. The result of this research is that the management of teaching staff at PKBM Global Mandiri is carried out transparently, accountably, and democratically from the recruitment process, development and training of teaching staffto the placement of positions and responsibilities, all of which are in line with the theory of students and A accredited institutions

ARTICLE INFO

Article History: Submitted/Received 25 July 2024 First Revised 30 July 2024 Accepted 23 Aug 2024 First Available online 30 Aug 2024 Publication Date 30 Aug 2024

Keyword:

Management, PKBM, Equality, Human Resources

© 2024 UPI Journals and Publications Office

1. INTRODUCTION

According to the Great Dictionary of the Indonesian Language (KBBI), the word equality has the meaning of "identical", "equal", or "same". The word equality according to John Rawls is that individuals have the same rights, opportunities, and freedoms to achieve goals (Yuanita, 2022). So, equality is a state where individuals have equal rights and opportunities and are treated without discrimination be it from their suk, religion, race, and background. Equality can include various aspects, namely social equality, legal equality, and gender equality (Judiasih, 2022). Social equality is further divided into several aspects, namely equality in health and education (Indriyany, 2021).

All individuals have the right to have the same right to education, be it formal education such as elementary, junior high, high school or non-formal education can be through learning communities or learning studios such as PKBM (Nugrahen 2022). The rules for pursuing equality in education through non-formal education are regulated in the 1945 Constitution article 31 paragraphs 1 to 5 (Tamam, 2018). It is stated that non-formal education provides a learning forum to provide facilities for educational equality (Zaifullah, et al., 2023). According to Law No. 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System, PKBM (Center for Teaching and Learning Activities) is recognized as a Non-Formal Education with the system of pursuing equality packages. Some of the programs available at PKBM are equivalency packages A, B and C, several other programs such as skills and life skills programs (Rimbarizki, 2017). PKBM in Indonesia is usually managed by foundations, community groups and individuals by registering with the Education Office.

The learning process in the equality program is certainly crucial, the role of teaching staff who are able to master the material and also be able to convey the material effectively and efficiently to students is needed (Riyatuljannah, T. 2020). Teaching staff are one of the important resources in PKBM, not only during the learning process but also at the planning stage and also at the evaluation stage, human resources who process and implement the entire program (Ernawati, 2017).

Teaching staff in equality programs in non-formal educational institutions have greater responsibilities and duties when compared to teaching staff in formal education institutions (Susanti, 2014). This is because students in non-formal education units such as PKBM have more diverse backgrounds than students in formal education units (Puspito, 2021). In PKBM, students usually have different ages and it is not uncommon for the age range to be quite far from each other. In addition to age, the educational background of the participants such as their cognitive and affective abilities is also different so that PKBM teaching staff are certainly required to master various techniques and methods that suit the needs of students. The problem is that some educators have tasks that are not in accordance with their educational background and talent interests, this results in managed learning running less effectively (Fatmawati, 2021).

Problems that often occur to teaching staff in PKBM also include the lack of human resources in PKBM (Sunarsi, 2018). This is due to many factors such as: not meeting the qualifications of non-formal teaching staff, not being able to teach adult students with different age ranges, it can then affect the interest and desire of prospective teaching staff to register as teachers in non-formal units. In addition, an environment that is not friendly to teaching staff, as well as the relationship between teaching staff and other teaching staff or the relationship with the head of PKBM is also one of the things that needs to be considered (Eliaumra, 2017).

Teaching staff at PKBM Global Mandiri participate in a number of activities that aim to develop professional skills in teaching and also conduct evaluation activities to find out the shortcomings and needs that have not been achieved before. They also often participate in mentoring activities from the center of the Education Office as a government effort to develop the abilities of teaching staff in non-formal units. This PKBM has received an A accreditation score that is trusted by students to pursue their educational equality, even though it is classified as a private educational institution but does not eliminate their good quality. The results of this study also include the teaching staff admission system at PKBM, especially for the equality program, including experience qualifications, teaching ability, and educational background.

There are four competencies that must be possessed by teaching staff in PKBM (Community Learning Center), which include pedagogic competence, professional competence, personal competence, and social competence. Pedagogic competence is the ability of teachers to manage the learning process, including planning, implementing, and evaluating learning. In PKBM, teaching staff must be able to understand the diverse characteristics of students in terms of age, educational background, and learning needs. Teachers are required to use various innovative and contextual teaching strategies and methods that align with the conditions of the students in PKBM. This is important because students in PKBM have different needs that require a flexible and adaptive learning approach. (Hermawan's, 2019) shows that teaching staff with good pedagogic competence can increase student engagement and motivation, which ultimately contributes positively to the achievement of educational equality.

Professional competence includes mastery of the teaching material and the ability to apply it in learning. In PKBM, teachers must have a deep understanding of the material relevant to the equivalency programs taught and the skills to continuously update their knowledge in line with the latest developments. The attitude shown by teaching staff in this competency is openness to continuous learning and self-development, as well as perseverance in facing various challenges that arise in the non-formal learning environment of PKBM. According to (Sari,2020), teaching staff with good professional competence tend to be more effective in delivering material, making it easier for students from various backgrounds to understand, thereby increasing the effectiveness of learning in PKBM.

Personal competence is the ability of teaching staff to act and behave according to prevailing norms and ethics and to be role models for students. In PKBM, attitudes and behaviors such as patience, empathy, and adaptability are crucial, considering the highly varied backgrounds of the students. Teaching staff with good personal competence will create an inclusive and supportive learning environment, which is highly needed in the non-formal education setting. Research conducted by (Putri, 2021) found that strong personal competence in PKBM teaching staff not only helps build harmonious relationships with students but also boosts their confidence and motivation to learn, contributing to the success of educational programs in PKBM.

Social competence includes the ability of teaching staff to communicate and interact effectively with students, fellow teachers, and other related parties in the PKBM environment. This competence involves teamwork skills, building good relationships with the community, and acting as a liaison between students and other learning resources outside the classroom. The attitudes required in this competency include openness, teamwork skills, and sensitivity to the social needs of students. (Nugroho's, 2018) emphasizes that good social competence in PKBM teaching staff not only increases community involvement in equality

programs but also strengthens support for non-formal education programs, ultimately supporting the achievement of inclusive and quality educational equality.

Teaching staff in PKBM still face challenges in meeting the four required competencies: pedagogic, professional, personal, and social. Although some teachers in PKBM have shown the ability to plan and manage learning well and strive to use methods that adapt to students' needs, gaps remain to be addressed. Research by (Fatmawati, 2021) shows that some teaching staff are still placed in roles that do not align with their educational background and interests, resulting in less effective learning. Additionally, the professional competence of PKBM teachers is often suboptimal due to limited mastery of teaching materials and a lack of opportunities for professional development training.

From the perspective of personal competence, PKBM teaching staff generally demonstrate patience and empathy toward students from diverse backgrounds. However, challenges remain, especially in dealing with students who have various personal and social issues that affect the learning process. This is reinforced by the findings of (Putri, 2021), which state that although some teaching staff are capable of being role models and creating a positive learning environment, not all teachers can consistently maintain these attitudes, particularly amid resource and support constraints.

Social competence among teachers also needs improvement, particularly in terms of communication skills and building good relationships with students, colleagues, and the surrounding community. According to (Nugroho, 2018), effective interaction and teamwork skills are crucial in the PKBM environment, yet gaps in these skills still exist among teaching staff. This impacts the limited support and community involvement in educational equality programs in PKBM.

Overall, although teaching staff in PKBM possess the foundational competencies needed, there are still many aspects that need further improvement and development. Efforts to enhance these competencies through training, mentoring, and continuous evaluation are essential to ensure that PKBM teachers can fully meet these four competencies and provide high-quality and inclusive education for all students.

2. METHODS

This research uses a qualitative method, which focuses on extracting information about human resource management as teaching staff in non-formal educational institutions in the equality program package C. This research was carried out at PKBM Global Mandiri in Kemayoran District, Central Jakarta City. Within 1 month or 30 days in April 2024. This study interviewed a tutor of the equality program package C as the main source of data in this study. The data was collected through interview techniques. Interview is one of the data collection techniques that is one-way and is carried out verbally or orally between the questioner and the answerer, in its implementation this technique uses an interview instrument as a data collection tool. In addition, the researcher also uses documentation techniques in data collection. Documentation is a technique where data is collected from existing records or written files.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In managing the PKBM Global Mandiri Equality Package, important aspects are needed, one of which is human resource management. According to the interview data that we have

conducted, the management of PKBM Global Mandiri teaching staff starts from the recruitment process in which there is an interview stage, then the process of positioning positions and responsibilities based on the results of the interview, to improve teaching abilities and skills at PKBM Global Mandiri, teaching staff are also included in a number of training activities from the center of the Education Office, finally in the management of PKBM Global Mandiri teaching staff as well conduct a major meeting before the school year begins and an evaluation when the school year ends.

The management of human resources, including recruitment, placement, training, and evaluation of teaching staff, is crucial in managing the Equality Package at PKBM Global Mandiri because it directly affects the quality of learning and the achievement of educational equality goals. Firstly, the recruitment process that involves interviews and position placement based on competencies is essential to ensure that the teaching staff has the skills and backgrounds that match the program's needs. According to research by (Nugraha, 2019), proper recruitment can enhance the quality of education because competent teaching staff are better equipped to face the challenges of teaching in a non-formal education environment.

Secondly, the participation of teaching staff in training organized by the Education Office is important for updating and improving their teaching skills. This aligns with findings by (Setiawan,2020) which show that ongoing professional development training for teaching staff at PKBM contributes to improving their ability to deliver materials effectively and increasing student motivation. Thirdly, holding major meetings before the start of the academic year and conducting evaluations at the end of the academic year are also necessary to align the vision and mission, as well as evaluate program achievements. Research by (Puspito, 2021) indicates that regular evaluations of teaching staff performance and educational programs can help identify areas needing improvement and formulate more effective strategies for the future. Overall, proper management of teaching staff through accurate recruitment, continuous training, and structured evaluations is essential to ensure that PKBM can provide quality and inclusive equality education, in line with findings from various studies in the field of non-formal education.

At PKBM Global Mandiri, the recruitment process and position placement are carried out directly by the head of PKBM, prospective teaching staff will later conduct an interview session to find out their experience and ability in teaching students in non-formal units. The selection process then continued by submitting supporting files after being declared to have passed the interview session. Furthermore, teaching staff will be placed according to their respective expertise and educational background, at PKBM Global Mandiri the educational background of the accepted teaching staff is D3 and S1. From the results of the data collection, it can be said that human resource management is in line with the theory of Scientific Management proposed by FW. Taylor, Frank & Lilian Gilberth, Henry Gantt, and Harrington Emerson in 1870-1930, where teaching staff are selected and placed according to their respective expertise (Utamy, 2020). According to this theory, increasing productivity is done by dividing tasks in completing a certain job. The principle is to develop scientific methods, in this context to select teaching staff according to their expertise and responsibilities. Frank and Lilian Gilberth put forward the concept of "Psychology of Management", namely in the management of an organization or group, understanding psychology and the needs of its members is important (Kurniawan, 2024).

In providing materials and training to students, teaching staff at PKBM Global Mandiri often face challenges in implementing learning methods and systems. This is due to the many differences in the background of the students (Kisworo, 2017). However, the material delivery

system must be done creatively so that students can understand it well. This shows the application of the concept of Modern Management theory where employees need ideas and aspirations in managing an organization (Kurniawan, 2024). In the management of the PKBM Global Equality Package, Mandiri applies this concept by carrying out various learning methods and systems to attract students' interest in learning. Not only do they give orders from their superiors, but teaching staff participate in conveying ideas and innovations in delivering material to students. Modern Management Theory emphasizes a deep understanding of organizational behavior, group dynamics, individual motivation, and environmental change (Mubarak, 2023). Stated by a figure named Abraham Maslow, it is stated that individual motivation must be understood so as to create a work environment that meets the expectations and needs of employees in improving performance (Widodo, 2022). This theory involves employee participation in making decisions to provide creative ideas or innovation, participation and adaptability.

Based on the results of the interviews, the teaching staff have a special activity that is carried out once a year, namely at the beginning of the year where this activity aims to meet and determine the division of class duties and responsibilities held by the teaching staff, besides that this activity is also carried out at the same time to strengthen the relationship and kinship while being a teacher and contributing to PKBM Global Mandiri. This is in line with the theory developed by Elton Mayo, namely human relations, where there is a good relationship and interaction between teachers and the head of PKBM. In addition, there is communication and a form of support from superiors to the teaching staff so that it builds a harmonious work environment and can build the enthusiasm and motivation of the teaching staff. In addition to the beginning of the year meeting, the teaching staff also conducts an evaluation meeting at the end of the year in the same way when the beginning of the year meeting is held. This is in line with the Human Relationship Theory put forward by Elton Mayo and other researchers such as Fritz Roethlisberger and William Dickson. This concept explains that social relationships in the workplace have a significant impact on employee performance, satisfaction, and motivation. Social factors that occur with interaction between employees or colleagues and support from superiors can affect employee productivity and behavior (Kusumajati, 2014).

This certainly has an influence on the quality of PKBM Global Mandiri. From the existence of a good communication relationship, more effective evaluation can be carried out. So that the evaluation process determines their performance to be better than before on a regular basis and affects the reputation of PKBM Global Mandiri. As evidenced by the large number of students in the equality program, until now PKBM Global Mandiri has a total of 216 students with the following information: 20 participants in package A, 39 participants in package B and 157 participants in package C. In addition, PKBM Global Mandiri currently has accreditation A in 2023/2024 even though it is classified as a private non-formal education unit, PKBM Global Mandiri succeeded in achieving A accreditation and was trusted by its participants to become a non-formal educational institution.

The participation of educators is crucial in enhancing the quality of PKBM (Community Learning Centers) because educators play a direct role in the learning process, planning, and program evaluation. Their active participation in various aspects of educational management, such as curriculum development, material preparation, and the implementation of innovative teaching methods, can improve the effectiveness of the teaching and learning process. According to research by (Setiawan, 2020), the involvement of educators in decision-making

and the delivery of creative ideas can also increase their motivation, which positively impacts students' enthusiasm for learning. Additionally, the participation of educators in ongoing professional training and development plays an important role in enhancing their competencies, which in turn leads to improved quality of education provided. Therefore, the participation of educators not only impacts their skills and knowledge but also contributes to achieving quality and inclusive equality education at PKBM.

Educator competence is the key to achieving excellence in PKBM (Community Learning Centers). Competent educators are able to manage learning effectively, understand the characteristics and needs of students, and apply appropriate and innovative teaching methods. Pedagogical competence, for instance, enables educators to design and implement engaging and adaptive learning processes that cater to the diverse backgrounds of students at PKBM. Moreover, professional competence ensures that educators have a strong grasp of the subject matter and can teach it in a way that is easily understood.

Personal competence is also essential, as educators must be able to set a good example, have integrity, be patient, and build positive relationships with students. This is important for creating an inclusive and supportive learning environment where students feel comfortable and motivated to learn. Lastly, social competence includes the ability to communicate and interact well with students, colleagues, and the surrounding community. This competence helps educators build strong networks of cooperation that support the achievement of educational goals at PKBM.

By developing these four competencies in a balanced way, educators can significantly contribute to the improvement of educational quality at PKBM. They not only act as teachers but also as mentors, motivators, and facilitators who support the achievement of high-quality and sustainable learning. Excellence in PKBM will be achieved if educators continuously strive to enhance their competencies through training, professional development, and reflection on their teaching practices.

The role of educators in PKBM also contributes to building close relationships with the surrounding community, which is one of the important factors in the success of educational equality programs. Educators who are actively involved in community activities and collaborate with various parties, such as parents, community leaders, and other institutions, can create a strong support network for students. This aligns with the findings of Kurniawati (2022), which show that collaboration between educators and the community can enhance accessibility and participation of students in PKBM programs. With strong support from various parties, PKBM can be more effective in achieving the goals of educational equality and can provide a broader impact on society, particularly in improving quality of life through education. Overall, the role and management of educators are key factors in achieving excellent and sustainable quality in PKBM.

Previous research has shown that the role and management of educators are crucial in achieving superior and sustainable educational quality in PKBM (Community Learning Centers). Competent and well-managed educators are able to design and implement effective, adaptive learning processes that meet the diverse needs of learners. Educator management that includes selective recruitment, continuous training, and systematic performance evaluation ensures that educators have the necessary skills and knowledge to provide high-quality education.

Analysis from various studies also indicates that when educators are empowered through effective management, they tend to be more motivated and committed in carrying out their duties. This contributes to the improvement of learners' outcomes and the achievement of educational goals in PKBM. Additionally, good educator management helps create a positive

work environment, encourages innovation in teaching methods, and ensures the sustainability of educational programs through the retention of qualified educators.

4. CONCLUSION

Management theory continues to develop with the times and is adapted to a certain organization or institution. In PKBM Global Mandiri, a non-formal institution that provides an equality package program receives accreditation A. In the management of PKBM Global Mandiri, the most important supporting aspect is human resource management. In accordance with the three management theories, namely 1) Classical Management Theory, 2) Human Relations Theory, and 3) Modern Management Theory, PKBM Global Mandiri applies these three concepts. However, the concept of human relations put forward by Elton Mayo is one of the important aspects with the other two theories as support. This concept explains that social relationships in the workplace have a significant impact on employee performance, satisfaction, and motivation. This relationship was born from good communication between fellow employees and support from superiors so that it can improve the performance and motivation of employees in managing PKBM. This is evidenced by the large number of participants of PKBM Global Mandiri with a total of 216 students with the information: 20 participants of package A, 39 participants of package B and 157 participants of package C. This shows that the management at PKBM Global Mandiri is carried out well so that it gets accreditation A and is trusted by students as a non-formal institution in obtaining educational equality.

5. REFERENCES

- Ernawati, E., & Mulyono, S. E. (2017). Manajemen pembelajaran program paket C di PKBM Bangkit Kota Semarang. *Journal of Nonformal Education*, *3*(1), 60-71.
- Eliaumra, E. (2017). Education For Sustainable Development. *Jurnal Kependidikan, 10*(1), 43-59.
- Fatmawati, I. (2021). Peran guru dalam pengembangan kurikulum dan pembelajaran. *Revorma: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pemikiran*, 1(1), 20-37.
- Hermawan. (2019). *Pengaruh Kompetensi Pedagogik terhadap Motivasi Belajar Peserta Didik di PKBM*. Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan, 8(4), 245-255.
- Indriyany, I. A., Hikmawan, M. D., & Utami, W. K. (2021). Gender dan pendidikan tinggi: Studi tentang urgensitas kampus berperspektif gender. *JIIP: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pemerintahan*, *6*(1), 55-72.
- Kurniawati, (2022). Collaboration between Educators and Communities in PKBM: Enhancing Accessibility and Participation. Journal of Community Education, 10(2), 145-158.
- Kurniawan, B., Imama, H. N., Maghfiroh, H., & Yusiana, Y. (2024). The Role of Management Psychology in Forming Attachment and Motivation for Organizational Performance: Peran Psikologi Manajemen Dalam Membentuk Keterikatan Dan Motivasi Kinerja Organisasi. Khalifah: Jurnal Pendidikan Nusantara, 2(1), 12-22.

Rahmansyah, dkk.. Management of Teaching Staff for Equality Package at PKBM Global Mandiri | 36

- Kisworo, B. (2017). Implementasi Media Pembelajaran Berbasis Prinsip-Prinsip Pendidikan Orang Dewasa Pkbm Indonesia Pusaka Ngaliyan Kota Semarang. *Journal of Nonformal Education*, 3(1), 80-86.
- Kusumajati, D. A. (2014). Organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) karyawan pada perusahaan. *Humaniora*, 5(1), 62-70.
- Judiasih, S. D. (2022). Implementasi kesetaraan gender dalam beberapa aspek kehidupan bermasyarakat di Indonesia. ACTA DIURNAL Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Kenotariatan, 5(2), 284-302.
- Mubarak, M. A., & El Widdah, M. (2023). konsep dasar perilaku organisasi dan kontribusi disiplin ilmu terhadap organisasi. *Didaktik: Jurnal Ilmiah PGSD STKIP Subang*, *9*(5), 4136-4149.
- Nugraheni, A. S. C., & Alfarizki, F. R. (2022). Optimizing The Existence of Non-Formal Education to Support Childrens's Developmental Rights. *DWIJA CENDEKIA: Jurnal Riset Pedagogik*, *6*(3), 501-510.
- Nugroho. (2018). Kompetensi Sosial Tenaga Pengajar di PKBM: Kunci Kesuksesan Pembelajaran Inklusif. Jurnal Pendidikan Inklusif, 4(2), 67-76.
- Nugraha, (2019). The Importance of Proper Recruitment in Enhancing Educational Quality in Non-Formal Education. Journal of Non-Formal Education, 7(2), 145-156.
- Puspito, G. W., Swandari, T., & Rokhman, M. (2021). Manajemen Strategi Pengembangan Pendidikan Non Formal. *Chalim Journal of Teaching and Learning*, 1(1), 85-98.
- Puspito, (2021). The Role of Regular Evaluations in Improving Teaching Staff Performance in *PKBM*. Journal of Educational Management, 9(1), 89-100.
- Putri. (2021). Kompetensi Kepribadian Tenaga Pengajar dan Pengaruhnya Terhadap Motivasi Belajar Peserta Didik di PKBM. Jurnal Pendidikan Karakter, 7(5), 180-190.
- Rimbarizki, R., & Susilo, H. (2017). Penerapan pembelajaran daring kombinasi dalam meningkatkan motivasi belajar peserta didik paket C vokasi di pusat kegiatan belajar masyarakat (PKBM) Pioneer Karanganyar. *J+ Plus Unesa, 6*(2), 1-12.
- Riyatuljannah, T. (2020). Peran dan fungsi kepala sekolah dalam mewujudkan sekolah efektif di lingkungan sekolah dasar. *Al-Aulad: Journal of Islamic Primary Education*, *3*(2), 56-68.
- Sari. (2020). *Penguasaan Materi Ajar oleh Tenaga Pengajar di PKBM*. Jurnal Pendidikan Profesional, 9(3), 145-155.
- Setiawan, (2020). The Impact of Continuous Professional Development on Teaching Effectiveness in PKBM. Journal of Teacher Education, 11(3), 210-222.
- Susanti. (2014). Perbandingan Tugas dan Tanggung Jawab Tenaga Pengajar di Pendidikan Formal dan Nonformal. Jurnal Pendidikan Nonformal, 2(3), 98-108.
- Sunarsi, D. (2018). Analisis Motivasi Kerja Tenaga Pendidik Sukarela Pada Pusat Kegiatan Belajar Masyarakat (PKBM) Bimasda Kota Tangerang Selatan. *Kreatif: Jurnal Ilmiah Prodi Manajemen Universitas Pamulang*, 6(2), 53-65.

- Tamam, B. (2018). Reorientasi pendanaan pendidikan dalam membangun mutu sekolah. Misykat Al-Anwar Jurnal Kajian Islam Dan Masyarakat, 1(2), 44-57.
- Utamy, R., Ahmad, S., & Eddy, S. (2020). Implementasi manajemen sumber daya manusia. *Journal of Education Research*, 1(3), 225-236.
- Yuanita, A. C. (2022). Menelaah Konsep Keadilan Hukum Teori Keadilan John Rawls dalam Pemutusan Hubungan Kerja secara Sepihak terhadap Pekerja Migran Indonesia di Luar Negeri. Interdisciplinary Journal on Law, Social Sciences and Humanities, 3(2), 130-142.
- Zaifullah, Z., Cikka, H., Kahar, M. I., Ismail, M. J., & Iskadar, I. (2023). Peran Pusat Kegiatan Belajar Masyarakat (PKBM) Dalam Penyelenggaraan Pendidikan Nonformal di Era Society 5.0. Innovative: Journal Of Social Science Research, 3(2), 14539-14549.