



Sustainable Heritage Tourism Development : A Study Systematic Literature Review

Nirmala Aulia Firdausi

Universiti Teknologi MARA, Puncak Alam, Malaysia
Correspondence: E-mail: 2023251278@isiswa.uitm.edu.my

ABSTRACT

Tourism is a multifaceted field with a path of adventure, cultural immersion, and beautiful encounters. Cultural heritage certainly has benefits that can be implemented in today's era. Of course, this article has provided a descriptive analysis based on the worldview of various authors. The main objectives of this study are to determine which indicators should be used in measuring the level of desirability of heritage cities, to see in which countries the most sustainable urban heritage studies are conducted, and to find trends and areas of study related to this research topic. The research used in this study is the SLR (Systematic Literature Review) method. Data collection was carried out by documenting all articles that have similar research in the research report. This study highlights the importance of infrastructure development, community involvement, education and stakeholder collaboration in achieving sustainable tourism heritage. Through initiatives like this, Malaysia can continue to attract tourists while preserving its unique cultural heritage for future generations.

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:

Submitted/Receive; 03 March 2024

First Revised; 17 Jul 2024

Accepted; 10 Oct 2024

First Available online; 30 Dec 2024

Publication; 30 Dec 2024

Keyword:

Heritage Tourism, Sustainable Heritage Tourism, Strategy, Tourism.

1. INTRODUCTION

Tourism, often known as the art of tourism, it has become a multifaceted field with a rich tapestry of adventure, cultural immersion, and thrilling encounters. In a time when the world is more connected than ever, travel offers a window into the wonders of many landscapes, people, and traditions. Tourism as a domain of study has in the main, provided descriptive analysis based on the world view of various authors. For example, in 1910 an Austrian economist, Herman Von Schullar, defined tourism as the total of operations, mainly of an economic nature, which directly relate to the entry, stay, and movement of foreigners inside and outside a certain country, city, or region. Tourism is a highly complex phenomenon and can be fully understood only by adopting a multidisciplinary. Tourism as a social force and institution is impacting the lives of people and many are associated with the industry directly or indirectly (Chen et al., 2021).

Tourism is recognized as a resource-intensive industry; it needs, therefore, to be accountable in terms of sustainability at both local and global scales. Sustainable tourism (ST) is a major focus in the debate on environmentally integrated tourism development, but existing research shows that sustainability is a complex concept, and one that requires more critical and comprehensive analysis. One part of the tourism sector is heritage tourism. Heritage is a buzzword that has emerged since the 1990s. Heritage is considered one of the most important and fastest growing elements of tourism. This topic is increasingly in demand in various fields, and research on this subject is considered useful for understanding the social behavior of individuals and society as a whole. Research focuses on the burgeoning heritage industry), where researchers often distinguish between cultural *elements* (Richards 1996), *natural* (Hall 2000) and *artificial elements* (Pessot et al., 2021)

Heritage tourism is defined as “visits by persons from outside the host community motivated wholly or in part by interest in historical, artistic, scientific, lifestyle, or cultural offerings of a community, region, group, or institution” (Silberberg, 1995, p. 361). Examples of heritage tourism products include cultural heritage tours, heritage trails, purpose-built heritage theme parks, museums, galleries, and cultural/visitor centers. It has been recognized as one of the major growth markets in global tourism by the United Nations World Tourism Organization. Rowan and Baram (2004) describe heritage tourism as a consumerist phenomenon and hence marketing of this phenomenon is bound to be driven by capitalist tendencies (Rahmadian et al., 2022 ; Ismail et al., 2021).

Heritage tourism is increasingly proposed as an economic solution for declining rural economies, promising to compensate for lost manufacturing activities and granting ‘uniqueness’ in a crowded marketplace. As a term, heritage tourism describes a type of special-interest tourism, in which the heritage destination plays a central role in shaping travellers’ motivations and experiences (El et al., 2023). In recent years, cultural heritage tourism has gained significantly attention as a powerful driver of economic growth and development in many countries. Malaysia, with its rich and diverse cultural heritage, has recognized the potential of cultural tourism as a key sector for the growth of its tourism industry. The country has increasingly focused on promoting cultural heritage tourism through national tourism, signaling its significance in shaping the future of policies tourism in Malaysia. However, as Malaysia strives to develop cultural heritage tourism, it is essential to ensure that this development is managed in a sustainable manner (Nave et al., 2021).

Sustainable tourism development is characterized by meeting the needs of local communities, satisfying the demands of tourists, and safeguarding the remaining natural and cultural resources. This approach ensures that tourism can continue to thrive in the long term terms without causing harm to the environment, local communities, or culture heritage sites (Nave et al., 2021). Heritage is important to tourism but this does not automatically imply that tourism is important to heritage. Tourism is highly selective and heritage has other uses that may well be accorded higher priorities. The heritage interests of visitors and locals are likely to be different. The problem is often in setting priorities in the national conservation effort, between the requirements of a lucrative foreign tourism and those of residents, which poses real dilemmas about what to conserve and how to interpret it (Streimikiene et al., 2021).

The study of sustainable development of heritage cities is different from that of ordinary cities. Many cultural heritage elements are not present in ordinary cities, for example, tangible and intangible

cultural heritage such as the architectural design of buildings that reflect the unique living culture of the local community, dialects used in daily speech, and lifestyle practices in cities based on certain ethnicities and sub-ethnic groups. These elements of cultural heritage make a city unique because they cannot be formed arbitrarily. Instead, these elements of heritage have been preserved and inherited from generation to generation until the present, eventually forming a unique urban appearance that has an aesthetic value that can be experienced today (Saleh et al., 2021). Therefore, the main purpose of this study was to determine which indicators should be used in measuring the level of sustainability of heritage cities, to see in which countries sustainable urban areas heritage studies are most performed, and to find trends and study areas related to this research topics. Especially the selection of indicators and study areas is crucial. After all, countries don't use all sustainability measurement instruments as cultural heritage indicators.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. Heritage

The concept of 'heritage' is undeniably very broad and dynamic, normally used as an umbrella term to describe the practice of intergenerational transmission and cultural continuity and denote the cultural resources of the past that are still valued in the present (Streimikiene et al., 2021). The International Council of Monuments and Sites suggests that heritage embraces both the natural and the cultural environment whereas the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation identifies heritage assets as both tangible and intangible (El et al., 2023).

Heritage is something valuable and can be passed down from one generation to another. It includes customs, culture, areas, buildings, archival materials and prints including the writing of related books and papers. Heritage can also be understood as the remains of history, customs and quality in a society or country and is recognized to play an important role (Fauzi & Abdul Ghani, 2022). Heritage is a version of the past received through objects and display, representations and engagements, spectacular locations and events, memories and commemorations, and the preparation of places for cultural purposes and consumption (Martins et al., 2022). The first text that gives a definition of the concept of heritage is the International Charter of Venice (1964). In the introduction, a first definition of heritage is given: "Imbued with a message from the past, the historic monuments of generations of people remain to the present day as living witnesses of their age-old traditions (Fahlevi, 2023).

2.2. Heritage Tourism

Heritage tourism is credited with relatively high daily expenditures, as a result of it being dominantly hotel based and thus this direct economic benefit will tend to accrue to the accommodation and other services rather than to the heritage facilities themselves, which frequently have low or non-existent user charges (Streimikiene et al., 2021).

Heritage tourism may be seen as satisfying the principal representatives of each of the three parties involved, namely, the heritage producers, the tourism industry and the local place managers. Heritage tourism offers a profitable return on the use of a free existing resource with the additional benefits of enhanced local identity, social cohesion and favourable market images.

Cultural Heritage are architectural works, works of monumental sculpture and painting, elements or structures of an archaeological nature, inscriptions, cave dwellings and combinations of features, which are of Outstanding Universal Value from the point of view of history, art or science (Orr et al., 2021).

Natural Heritage features consisting of physical and biological formations or groups of such formations, which are of Outstanding Universal Value from the aesthetic or scientific point of view. Geological and physiographical formations and precisely delineated areas which constitute the habitat of threatened species of animals and plants of Outstanding Universal Value from the point of view of science or conservation (Orr et al., 2021).

2.3. Conservation of Heritage Buildings

The heritage buildings are objects that evoke awe and curiosity about the community and its associated culture. Heritage buildings have architectural, aesthetic, historical, documentary, archaeological, economic, social, political, spiritual and symbolic value. However, the biggest impact is

emotional, as heritage buildings have a cultural identity and continuity that is part of their historical heritage. From architecture to the present, historic buildings have their own messages, which can only be recognized by uncovering the authentic historical record.

Conservation is a method of protecting cultural monuments from extinction and further preserving their cultural, aesthetic and functional value. Efforts to preserve Malaysia's historic buildings began relatively late. It was only in the 1980s, when the country was under Dr Tun's government, that the awareness of preserving historic buildings became apparent. Mahathir Mohamad actively planned economic development. Historic buildings and sites are left abandoned with no one trying to preserve them (Rasoolimanesh et al., 2023).

The development of heritage conservation in Malaysia began in major cities such as Kuala Lumpur and George Town. For example, the Kuala Lumpur Wet Market Building Preservation Project in 1986 sparked a phenomenon in heritage preservation practices in the country. This wet market was built in 1936 and is now known as Pasar Seni. Meanwhile, in George Town, the Penang City Council Structural Planning Report (1989) advocates an urban conservation policy to manage the development of conservation areas (Fauzi & Abdul, 2022).

2.4. Sustainable Heritage Tourism

The UNWTO definition of sustainable tourism (1999) shows relevance and affinity with its original framework as "tourism that meets the needs of current hosts and visitors while preserving opportunities for the future. The idea of sustainable development has emerged as a general environmental development approach that emphasizes the relationship between economic development and ecosystems. More famously, this concept was discussed at his 1992 United Nations Conference on Environment and Development in Rio, Brazil. The Rio Earth Summit crystallized the idea that the optimal form of growth must follow his three-pronged approach. It aims to achieve economic, social and environmental balance (see Agenda 21, United Nations, 1992).

Furthermore, the Budapest Declaration declared heritage 'as an instrument for the sustainable development of all societies through dialogue and mutual understanding'. Therefore, the latest four pillar version of sustainability includes economic viability, social justice, cultural vitality, and environmental responsibility. Similar to sustainable tourism, the pursuit of sustainable cultural heritage tourism (SHT) follows the general objectives listed above. Therefore, sustainability involves the symbiosis of tourism and cultural heritage by establishing appropriate communication channels between tourism and cultural heritage, balancing conservation and tourism, and reinvesting the revenues generated by tourism into cultural heritage. More importantly, the management of SHT requires fostering collaboration with the population and non-professionals.

According to Cohen (2002), the concept of social justice in the context of traumatic brain injury is particularly complex. This is because destination hosts are both partners in tourism development and users (or creators) of cultural heritage resources. Therefore, undesirable cultural changes, commercialization of culture, and loss of local control over cultural heritage resources are considered to be significant negative effects of tourism, posing serious obstacles to sociocultural well-being.

In this context, the planning of cultural tourism activities must take into account the collective and individual identities of destination hosts in order to promote social cohesion and achieve sustainability goals.

The basis of sustainable cultural tourism he can consider from two directions. First, we will consider the management of cultural heritage sites for tourists. This requires answers to the questions: "Why are tourists interested in cultural heritage?" and "How do tourists use cultural heritage?" Second, whether cultural heritage tourism can be managed to achieve regional goals, local economic development, which often requires consideration of the relationship between heritage and place, and the relationship between heritage tourism and the local economy (Streimikiene et al., 2021).

3. METHOD

This study uses the Systematic Literature Review (SLR) method which aims to recognize, review, and evaluate all relevant research so that it can answer predetermined research questions. Systematic Literature Review (SLR) is a term for identifying, evaluating, and interpreting all available research

relevant to the formulation of the problem or topic area studied. Systematic Literature Review (SLR) is defined as the process of identifying, assessing and interpreting all available research evidence with the aim of providing answers to specific research questions. SLR research is conducted to identify, evaluate, and interpret all relevant research results related to certain research questions, certain topics, or phenomena of concern (Kitchenham, 2004). The purpose of this SLR or Systematic Literature Review research is to find strategies that will help overcome the problems faced and identify different perspectives related to the problem being studied and reveal theories relevant to the case.

This research consists of several stages, namely the formulation of research questions, literature search, determination of inclusion and exclusion criteria, literature selection, data presentation, data processing and conclusions. Research that uses tools and materials, it is necessary to explain the sophistication of tool specifications and the type of material used (Fitriani & Putra, 2022). Researchers formulate questions regarding how, formulation, and strategy for sustainable heritage tourism development. After that, search literature studies on the Google Scholar, Science Direct, Taylor & Francis database using the Publish or Perish application. The keyword used is "sustainable heritage tourism". The next stage is for researchers to reviews the article intensely, especially the research results. At the end of the study, researchers compared the findings of several articles and made conclusions.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

4.1 Indicators Strategy of Sustainable Heritage Tourism

The results of the review some of article based on terms of sustainability heritage tourism are summarized in Table 1.

Table 1. Indicators Strategy Sustainable Heritage Tourism

No	Reference	Object	Dimensions	Conclusion
1.	(Huibin et al., 2013)	Lijiang in China and Penang in Malaysia	4DGPM <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - four Dimensions - four Goals - four Patterns - four Mechanisms 	the sustainable development cannot be realized unless nine specific goals are reached, namely protecting live history, inheriting cultural diversity, preserving traditional townscape, keeping cultural authenticity, systematic management, developing new marketing, penetrating old marketing, constructing infrastructure, and advocating community participation.
2.	(Foster, 2020)	Urban cultural heritage buildings	Circularity Strategies (R9) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - (Refuse, Rethink, Reduce) - (Reuse, Repair, Refurbish, Remanufacture, Repurpose) - (Recycle, Recover) 	In conclusion, the goal of circular economy is macro-level transformation to a sustainable economy. This goal cannot be reached without the micro level transformations supported by this research. It is not enough to focus on closing material loops to create new products from today's waste streams without care for the overall scale of resources used.

3.	(Guzman, 2020)	the World Heritage City of Queretaro, Mexico	Systemic Analysis Of Synergies Of Urban Factors And Heritage Conservation	The methodology proved transfer value by providing relevant insights on local governance capacities to (1) align a common vision for sustainable development, and (2) to coherently integrate heritage conservation, across levels and sectors. The analytical framework proved useful for the identification of balances and imbalances in strategic actions in cities, and thus in the urban system.
4.	(Sasana et al., 2019)	Semarang Old City, Indonesia	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Infrastructur Development 2. Human Resource Development 3. Product Marketing 4. Institutional 5. Potential Development 	Semarang City Government must continue to creating a vigorous revitalization area and this must be an urgent task. Moreover, events and exhibitions are examples of the strategies for promoting this idea to both local and foreign tourists. the stakeholders need to increase the environmental quality
5.	(Lak et al., 2020)	The Historic City Of Birjand, Iran,	SWOT Analysis	This case study from the developing world illustrates that heritage assets and tourism potential can have a significant bearing on how cities are, or can be, renewed socially, physically and economically
6.	(Kisi, 2019)	Zonguldak, located in Northwest Turkey	AHP - SWOT Hybrid Method - SWOT (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats) - AHP (Analytic Hierarchy Process)	the dependent economic structure may be broken down with the development of the tourism industry and, therefore, that some strategic initiatives are required to achieve sustainable tourism in the province.

7.	(Peng & Tzeng, 2019)	industrial heritage tourism	MADM Method (Multiple Attribute Decision-Making)	the decision-makers should highly prioritize improving high-priority criteria such as 'social usefulness', 'resource integration', 'destination policy and development', 'economic development', 'cultural links', 'cultural learning', and 'natural landscape resources' in advance to successfully achieving the aspired performance levels. Additionally, this study suggests meaningful industrial heritage tourism performance improvement strategies that have been rehabilitated throughout the world.
8.	(Zhang et al., 2020)	Suzhou Kunqu Opera	the theory of planned behavior to construct the influence mechanism of cultural identity on tourists' consumption intention in heritage tourism	cultural identity has a positive effect on consumption intentions in heritage tourism activities, confirming that cultural identity is an effective driving force to promote tourists' consumption intention
9.	(Roslan et al., 2021)	Natural Heritage In Jugra, Kuala Langat	physical, economic, and social valuation, social economic local community	This study aims to emphasize the role of local community as one of the stakeholders, as they should also be able to benefit from tourism development. All these would help boost the tourism industry, particularly through the archaeo-tourism and eco-tourism perspectives.
10.	(Chong & Balasingam, 2019)	Heritage Sites in Southeast Asia	stakeholder collaboration and involvement, stakeholder empowerment and the adaptive reuse approach.	It is significant for local government, site manager and stakeholders to carry out proper heritage management system. In this article, three of the site management strategies identified are useful for Southeast Asia country to adopt.

4.2 Strategies for Sustainable Heritage Tourism in Malaysia

4.2.1 Infrastructure Development and Management

The importance of well-maintained infrastructure to accommodate tourists while maintaining the integrity of the cultural heritage. Implement sustainable practices in waste management, energy consumption and transportation.

4.2.2 Community Involvement and Empowerment

Involvement of local communities in decision-making processes and the benefits of their active participation. Promote community-based tourism initiatives to ensure an equitable distribution of economic benefits.

4.2.3 Education and Awareness Programs

The importance of educating tourists and local communities about the importance of heritage and sustainable tourism practices. Conduct awareness campaigns, tours, and educational programs for tourists and local residents.

4.2.4 Stakeholder Collaboration and Partnerships

Collaboration between government agencies, tourism industry stakeholders, and local communities to develop sustainable cultural heritage tourism policies. Form partnerships to share resources, knowledge and best practices for heritage preservation and promotion.

5. CONCLUSION

In conclusion, research on the sustainable development of urban heritage needs to be further strengthened to meet the requirements of the SDGs and to make cities safe, inclusive and resilient for all communities. The SLR results show that research on sustainable development of heritage cities is mainly carried out in different strategy to heritage city areas.

Sustainable heritage tourism is critical to the preservation of Malaysia's cultural heritage and the long-term sustainability of the tourism industry. By taking a strategic approach and implementing sustainable practices, Malaysia can balance tourism development with cultural heritage protection. This article has highlighted the importance of infrastructure development, community engagement, education and stakeholder collaboration in achieving sustainable heritage tourism. Through initiatives like this, Malaysia can continue to attract tourists while preserving its unique cultural heritage for future generations.

7. REFERENCES

- Chen, S. H., Huang, J., & Tham, A. (2021). A systematic literature review of coffee and tea tourism. *International Journal of Culture, Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 15(3), 290-311.
- Chong, K. Y., & Balasingam, A. S. (2019). Tourism sustainability: economic benefits and strategies for preservation and conservation of heritage sites in Southeast Asia. *Tourism Review*, 74(2), 281–292. <https://doi.org/10.1108/TR-11-2017-0182>
- El Archi, Y., Benbba, B., Nizamatinova, Z., Issakov, Y., Vargáné, G. I., & Dávid, L. D. (2023). Systematic literature review analysing smart tourism destinations in context of sustainable development: Current applications and future directions. *Sustainability*, 15(6), 5086.
- Fahlevi, M. (2023). A Systematic Literature Review on Marine Tourism in Business Management: State of the Art and Future Research Agenda. *Journal of Tourism & Services*, 14(27).
- Fauzi, T. A. B. E., & Abdul Ghani, N. (2022). Conservation Potential and Impact of Heritage Buildings in Terengganu, Malaysia. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 12(10), 1096–1108. <https://doi.org/10.6007/ijarbss/v12-i10/15288>
- Foster, G. (2020). Circular economy strategies for adaptive reuse of cultural heritage buildings to reduce environmental impacts. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 152, 104507. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resconrec.2019.104507>
- Guzman, P. (2020). Assessing the sustainable development of the historic urban landscape through local indicators. Lessons from a Mexican World Heritage City. *Journal of Cultural Heritage*, 46, 320–327. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.culher.2020.06.017>

- Huibin, X., Marzuki, A., & Razak, A. A. (2013). Conceptualizing a sustainable development model for cultural heritage tourism in Asia. *Theoretical and Empirical Researches in Urban Management*, 8(1), 51–66.
- Ismail, F., Imran, A., Khan, N., & Qureshi, M. I. (2021). Past, present and future of ecotourism, a systematic literature review from last decade. *Studies of Applied Economics*, 39(4).
- Kisi, N. (2019). A Strategic Approach to Sustainable Tourism Development Using the A'WOT Hybrid Method: A Case Study of Zonguldak, Turkey. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 11(4). <https://doi.org/10.3390/su11040964>
- Lak, A., Gheitasi, M., & Timothy, D. J. (2020). Urban regeneration through heritage tourism: cultural policies and strategic management. *Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change*, 18(4), 386–403. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14766825.2019.1668002>
- Martins, A., Branco, M. C., Melo, P. N., & Machado, C. (2022). Sustainability in small and medium-sized enterprises: A systematic literature review and future research agenda. *Sustainability*, 14(11), 6493.
- Nave, A., do Paço, A., & Duarte, P. (2021). A systematic literature review on sustainability in the wine tourism industry: Insights and perspectives. *International Journal of Wine Business Research*, 33(4), 457-480.
- Orr, S. A., Richards, J., & Fatorić, S. (2021). Climate change and cultural heritage: A systematic literature review (2016–2020). *The Historic Environment: Policy & Practice*, 12(3-4), 434-477.
- Peng, K. H., & Tzeng, G. H. (2019). Exploring heritage tourism performance improvement for making sustainable development strategies using the hybrid-modified MADM model. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 22(8), 921–947. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2017.1306030>
- Pessot, E., Spoladore, D., Zangiaco, A., & Sacco, M. (2021). Natural resources in health tourism: a systematic literature review. *Sustainability*, 13(5), 2661.
- Rahmadian, E., Feitosa, D., & Zwitter, A. (2022). A systematic literature review on the use of big data for sustainable tourism. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 25(11), 1711-1730.
- Rasoolimanesh, S. M., Ramakrishna, S., Hall, C. M., Esfandiar, K., & Seyfi, S. (2023). A systematic scoping review of sustainable tourism indicators in relation to the sustainable development goals. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 31(7), 1497-1517.
- Roslan, Z. B., Ramli, Z., Razman, M. R., Asyraf, M. R. M., Ishak, M. R., Ilyas, R. A., & Nurazzi, N. M. (2021). Reflections on local community identity by evaluating heritage sustainability protection in Jugra, Selangor, Malaysia. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 13(16). <https://doi.org/10.3390/su13168705>
- Saleh, Y., Mahat, H., Hashim, M., Nayan, N., Suhaili, S., Ghazali, M. K. A., Hayati, R., & Utami, R. K. S. (2021). A systematic literature review (SLR) on the development of sustainable heritage cities in Malaysia. *Journal of Regional and City Planning*, 32(3), 290–310. <https://doi.org/10.5614/jpww.2021.32.3.6>
- Sasana, H., Nurcahyanto, H., & Novitaningtyas, I. (2019). The development strategy of world heritage tourism in Indonesia. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 8(5), 1–14.
- Shin, Y. H., & Yu, L. (2020). The influence of quality of physical environment, food and service on customer trust, customer satisfaction, and loyalty and moderating effect of gender: An empirical study on foreigners in South Korean restaurant. *International Journal of Advanced Culture Technology*, 8(3), 172–185.

- Streimikiene, D., Svagzdiene, B., Jasinskas, E., & Simanavicius, A. (2021). Sustainable tourism development and competitiveness: The systematic literature review. *Sustainable development*, 29(1), 259-271.
- Zhang, G., Chen, X., Law, R., & Zhang, M. (2020). Sustainability of heritage tourism: A structural perspective from cultural identity and consumption intention. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 12(21), 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su12219199>