



## The Perspective of Dienul-Islam in Reviewing Leadership for People

Mulyana Abdullah<sup>1</sup>, Wilodati<sup>2</sup>, Kama Abdulhakam<sup>3</sup>, Ratna Fitria<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Departement of General Education, Faculty of Social Science Education, Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Bandung, Indonesia

**Abstract.** Raising leader is a must at the same time as the demand for muslims. The problem is what are the policies and the act of us as the muslims whose stay and live in a country which it's not an Islamic state like Indonesia in the case of choosing the leader? Trough the implementing literacy and documentation study to a view of literature and report, this study found that The differences opinion among the clergies seen the one hand emphasized that the charge of muslim is forbidden being raised from among non-muslim. It is also the same with the other who insisted that raised the leader of the people from non-muslims it is permitted. In addressing these difference oppinions, the muslims who stay and live in Indonesia as a country with plural communities, should getting wiser to choose. The thing that most important to be understood is based on welfare for all citizens, there are some common law of syara'.

**Keywords:** Raising Leader, Leadership in Islam

**Correspondence.** mulya@upi.edu, wilodati@upi.edu, kama.ahakam@upi.edu, ratna\_fitria@upi.edu

**Article History.** Received January 2020, March 2021 in revised, Mei 2021 Accepted

© 2021. International Journal Pedagogy of Social Studies. Program Study of Social Studies Education

### A. INTRODUCTION

A leader in Islamic terms identical to what it is called as caliph (*khalifah*) which is

mean as acting or substitute. This term has been used after Rasulullah saw. died, but if refer to Allah Swt.:

وَإِذْ قَالَ رَبُّكَ لِلْمَلٰئِكَةِ اِنِّيْ جَاعِلٌ فِى الْاَرْضِ خَلِيْفَةًۭ قَالُوْۤا اَتَجْعَلُ فِیْهَا مَنْ یُّفْسِدُ فِیْهَا وَیَسْفِكُ الدِّمَآءَ وَنَحْنُ نُسَبِّحُ بِحَمْدِكَ وَنُقَدِّسُ لَكَ قَالَ اِنِّیْۤ اَعْلَمُ مَا لَا تَعْلَمُوْنَ - ۳۰

Earnestly when your Lord said unto the Angels: "Surely, I am going to appoint a caliph on earth." They said: "Why are You going to appoint (caliph) on earth which will cause destruction of it and shed blood, whereas we always exalt (*tasbih*) with praising and glorifying Thee?" The Lord spoke: "Surely I know what you don't" (2:30).

The term of *khalifah* in that verse is not just to show the caliphs after Rasulullah saw died, but also to all human beings who serve the maintenance of this earth. Islam view that the leadership has to figure on the one who capable of and can put themselves bearing the truth with set a good example, because he sticks to *uswatun hasanah*.

So, appoint a leader who will act as a group manager, organization or society is

the rights and obligations for muslims as presented by An-Nawawi (VI/291):

وَأَجْمَعُوا عَلَى أَنَّهُ يَجِبُ عَلَى الْمُسْلِمِينَ نَصَبُ خَلِيفَةٍ وَوَجُوبُهُ بِالشَّرْعِ لَا بِالْعَقْلِ  
وَعَنْ غَيْرِهِ أَنَّهُ يَجِبُ بِالْعَقْلِ لَا بِالشَّرْعِ فَبَاطِلَانِ وَأَمَّا مَا حُكِيَ عَنِ الْأَصَمِّ أَنَّهُ قَالَ : لَا يَجِبُ

The clergies agreed that indeed the muslims have to appoint a *khalifah*. This obligation (appoint a *khalifah*) took place based on *syariah*, not senses. As for what the story of Al-Ahsam, he said, “(*Khalifah*) not obligatory”.

Meanwhile, in *Rawdhah at-Thalibin wa 'Umdah al-Muftin* is mentioned (An-Nawawi, III/433), “Of course the people must have a leader in the way of raises up the religion, rescuing *sunnah*, help people who are persecuted, fulfill the rights and put them in the right place”. So that, it can be called that raising up *imamah* is *farđu kifayah*. If there is no one properly (to be a leader) but only one man, he was selected as *imam* (a leader) and obligate upon him to demand the *imamah* position if no one ask him first.”

Based on the description above, raising a leader is necessity and as the needs of community life management for muslims in order to create prosperity based on Islamic *syariah*. But, the problem is how are the attitudes and act of the muslims who live in a country which is not an Islamic state as well as Indonesia to elect a leader? This fact has been becoming a polemic among muslims in Indonesia which is in fact, it mounts confusion for common pepople, Al-Alusi (1422 H, h. 30) meaning the term of *يَسْتَخْلِفُكُمْ* :

قَالُوا أَوْذَيْنَا مِنْ قَبْلِ أَنْ تَأْتِيَنَا وَمِنْ بَعْدِ مَا جِئْتَنَا قَالَ عَسَى رَبُّكُمْ أَنْ يُهْلِكَ عَدُوَّكُمْ وَيَسْتَخْلِفَكُمْ فِي  
الْأَرْضِ فَيَنْظُرَ كَيْفَ تَعْمَلُونَ - ١٢٩

even it often be used by some people for their own benefit.

## B. METHOD

Refer to the questions as revealed in the introduction, this study have done with applied the literacy and documentation study which is focused to Islamic study of elect the leader based on many relevance literatures and reposrts.

## C. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### 1. Leader in Islamic Perspective

#### *The Meaning of The Concept of Leader (Khalifah)*

One term of leader in Islam identic as caliph (*khalifah*) which is means as acting or substitute that in this case is understood as vice (representatives) of people in managing their prosperity and welfare. Actually the term of *khalifah* in quran have varied meaning, which are *خَلَفَ* means “substitute”, it's *masdar* *خَلْفٌ* means “generation” of the future. *Fi'il* *أَسْتَخْلَفَ* (*يَسْتَخْلِفُ*) which mean “made ruling”, *ism al- fa'il* that *mansub* *مُسْتَخْلَفِينَ* which mean “rule” and so on.

Moses's people said: "We have oppressed (by Pharaoh) before you came to us". Moses answered: "Hopefully, Allah will destroy your enemies and make you as caliph (*khalifah*) on (His) earth, then Allah will see what you do" (7:129).

This *mufasir* means that verse trough leadership and political approach. And so, it can be understood that the verse explain leadership regeneration or succession which is the leader be given the power for managing certain region.

Meanwhile, Al-Suyuti (1403 H, p. 169) quoted Salman al-Farisi and Mua'wiyah's argues that *khalifah* is the government of muslim people. The other argue has been said by Al-Wahidi (1386 H, p. 228) who seen the term of *khalifah* is the position of kings and prophets as the rule. All of the concepts that be argued above would be understood by implementing political approach which is viewing the term of *khalifah* in leadership and government poiny of views.

Based on the last concept of *khalifah*,

وَأَجْمَعُوا عَلَى أَنَّهُ يَجِبُ عَلَى الْمُسْلِمِينَ نَصَبُ خَلِيفَةٍ وَوُجُوبُهُ بِالشَّرْعِ لَا بِالْعَقْلِ  
وَعَنْ غَيْرِهِ أَنَّهُ يَجِبُ بِالْعَقْلِ لَا بِالشَّرْعِ فَبَاطِلَانِ وَأَمَّا مَا حُكِيَ عَنِ الْأَصَمِّ أَنَّهُ قَالَ: لَا يَجِبُ

The clergies agreed that indeed the muslims have to appoint a *khalifah*. This obligation (appoint a *khalifah*) took place based on *syariah*, not senses. As for what the story of Al-Ahsam, he said, "(*Khalifah*) not obligatory".

Further more, An-Nawawi (III/433) in *Rawdhah at-Thalibin wa 'Umdah al-Muftin* affirmed, "Of course the people must have a leader in the way of raises up the

the chaliphate can occur because of the three elements that are interconnected as follow as Rahim (2012, p. 39) said:

...first, man as *khalifah*. Khalifah is a servant of Allah who get a mandate as the executor, officers, the benchmarks and establish policy and laws in accordance with the will of Allah Swt. and the aspiration of the people who have elected him; the second is *al-ard* (the earth). The erath or certain region is the place or facilities to implement the caliphate ... So that, a *khalifah* has obligation to manage (*ista'mara/prosperity*) the earth and everything in it or all resources for the welfare. Thus, a *khalifah* should have knowledges to manage all of it; and the third is the interconnecton between the power and the region, and its relation to The Power Giver (Allah Swt.) as *mustakhlif*.

The harmony of relations among caliph, man, Allah and the universe will determine the caliphate efficacy, even would a great benefit. This is why the muslims elect a leader (*khalifah*) is obligation for them as presented by An-Nawawi (VI/291):

religion, rescuing *sunnah*, help people who are persecuted, fulfill the rights and put them in the right place".

The importance of leadership is very understood by dear friends of Rasulullah saw, Faqih (2009, p 27) even said that they had to postpone the funeral of Rasulullah saw. to complete the determination of

leaders who would replaced him, so that there is no void of leadership. Because a

وَجَعَلْنَاهُمْ أَيْمَةً يَهْدُونَ بِأَمْرِنَا وَأَوْحَيْنَا إِلَيْهِمْ فِعْلَ الْخَيْرَاتِ وَإِقَامَ الصَّلَاةِ وَإِيتَاءَ الزَّكَاةِ وَكَانُوا لَنَا  
عَبِيدِينَ - ٧٣

society admitted that there is a supreme power in their lives.

### **Leader Criterion in Leadership According to Al-Quran**

There were many Western scientists's opinions that define the leadership differently, yet there was one thing that common, the leadership is an influence process to the others to achieve something, as Robbins (2003, p. 4) defined that leadership is "the ability to influence a group toward the achievement of goals". Meanwhile, Yukl (2009, p. 26) defined leadership as a process of "...influencing others to understand and agree about what needs to be done and how to do it, and the process of facilitating individual and collective efforts to accomplish shared objectives".

Based on the Western scientists opinion that is presented above, the key of leadership concept lies on "influencing others", as is affirmed by Schermerson, et.al (2011, p. 306), "Leadership is the process of influencing others and the process of facilitating individual and collective efforts

I made them as leaders who are guiding mankind by My command and I have revealed to them to do good deeds, prayers,

to accomplish shaved objectives".

In the meantime, a leader is a servant

of Allah Swt. in Islam point of view, relieving the men from stickiness to anyone, rising togetherness among humans, touching the aspect of humans relationships, humans and nature, confirmed someone to obey the leader during not disobedience and breaking God rule. Leadership is so vital for muslims life, so every solemn or goup have to had a leader, even in a verry little number, Muhammad saw. the Prophet said (Baqi, 2014, p. 535):

From Abu Said from Abu Hurairah who both said: Rasulullah saw. said: if there're three men go anywhere, let them made the one to be a leader (Hadith is narated by Bukhari-Muslim).

Related to leadership in Rasulullah saw. point of view, Noor (2011, p. 82) defined that the leadership is all actions which are focusing resources towards a goal that really useful. To notice the virtues of the leader (*khalifah*), it worth to explore the verses of al-quran which explain the term of *imam*. At least there're five virtues of leader in al-quran, which is

charity and only to me they worship (21:73).

And in:

وَجَعَلْنَا مِنْهُمْ أَيْمَةً يَهْدُونَ بِأَمْرِنَا لَمَّا صَبَرُوا وَكَانُوا بِآيَاتِنَا يُوقِنُونَ - ٢٤

and I made the leaders among them who are guiding by My command when they were patient and they believe in My words (32:24).

The virtues of leader which are stated on the both of verses are *يَهْدُونَ بِأَمْرِنَا* (guiding by command of Allah Swt.), *وَأَوْحَيْنَا إِلَيْهِمْ فِعْلَ الْخَيْرَاتِ* (and I have revealed to them to do good deeds), *عَبِيدِنِ* (always worship to Allah), *صَبْرًا* (patient), and *يُوقِنُونَ* (believe to Allah Swt.).

In the words of wisdom explained

*خُذِ الْعَفْوَ وَأْمُرْ بِالْعُرْفِ وَأَعْرِضْ عَنِ الْجَاهِلِينَ - ١٩٩*

(7:199).

That verse order the muslim people to be a forgiver, and it has be exemplified in leadership behavior of Umar bin al-Khaththab ra. when Uyainah came to him, he said: "Hi Ibnul Khaththab, for the name of Allah, you didn't give us enough and didn't punish fairly". Umar angry then will hit him. One of his brother said: "Hi *Amirul mukminin*, surely Allah Swt. have said: *خُذِ الْعَفْوَ وَأْمُرْ بِالْعُرْفِ وَأَعْرِضْ عَنِ الْجَاهِلِينَ* (Be forgiver and send the persons do *ma'ruf* and turn away from the ignorants)". For the name of Allah, when he heard that verse be read, Umar ignore to hit him because he the one who committ to *Kitabullah*.

### **Elect the Leader Based on Islamic Syara**

Although there're many different oppinins among the clergies, elect the leader for muslim people is something needed that can't be avoid in society lives. Without leader, the society will undirection, it will even reveal the chaos in life (*balumminannas*). Though quibble to apply al-quran and *sunnah*, a confrontation

that "The good leader is the leader which is the innocent people feel safe and the sinners feel fear. The bad leader is the leader which is the innocent people feel fear and the sinners feel save". Al-Atsari (2010) stated by exemplified Umar bin al-Khaththab ra. talks to al-Mughirah when he is appointed as Kufah Governor: "Hi Mughirah, let the innocent people feel safe with you and the bad guys fear to you". Allah Swt. even said:

Be forgiver and send the persons do *ma'ruf* and turn away from the ignorants

between a person beliefs with the others will often occurs, and it is likely sparks discord and even become hostility among them.

Similarly in our daily lives as citizen of the state which is not Islamic state constitutionally. The existence of leader who had a role as the manager of and controller of, and at the same time as the party responsible for the regularity of social life of an Indonesian society which is plural in rases, ethnics, or religions. Without someone who manage the society life, confrontation between the differences of character of society will happen frequently, and if it is left continue, disintegration among Indonesian citizens will cause and threatening the social life.

Thus, regardless of whether or not to select and appoint leader, it is necessity in the context of creating the comfortable social life. But there're another problems, especially for Indonesian muslims, which are do we have to elect muslim leader and refuse non-muslim leader? How do Islam

MULYANA ABDULLAH, WILODATI, KAMA ABDULHAKAM, RATNA FITRIA/  
The Perspective of Dienul-Islam in Reviewing Leadership for People

put the fundament to all its adherents in context of electing a leader?

The one who belief that elect the non-muslim leader is forbidden in islam was propounded offer of al-quran (5:51), (2:120) and (3:28).

The meaning of word *أُولِيَاءَ* in those verses is interpreted as “leader”. The word

of “*wali*” (*awliyaa*) in these verses has mean could also mean protector, helper or leader. In verse 5:51 Allah forbade muslims to choose the leaders who are devout Christians or Jews.

According to Baits (2015), Al-Hafidz Ibnu Hajar provided more harder:

“  
إِنَّ الْإِمَامَ يَنْعَزَلُ بِالْكَفْرِ إِجْمَاعًا ، فَيَجِبُ عَلَى كُلِّ مُسْلِمٍ الْقِيَامُ فِي ذَلِكَ ، فَمَنْ قَوِيَ  
عَلَى ذَلِكَ فَلَهُ الثَّوَابُ ، وَمَنْ دَاهَنَ فَعَلِيهِ الْإِثْمُ ، وَمَنْ عَجَزَ وَجِبَتْ عَلَيْهِ الْهَجْرَةُ مِنْ تِلْكَ  
الْأَرْضِ

Indeed, the leader is deposed because his *kufir* by mutual agreement of the clergies. It is obliged to the muslims to depose him. The one who can do that, will be reward. And the one who platitude with them, then he will be sin. And the one who is unable to,

previously to escape from the area (*Fathul Bari*, 13/123).

The doctrines that be spoken by these clergies based on hadith of Ubadah bin Shamit ra. (Baits, 2015):

بَايَعْنَا عَلَى السَّمْعِ وَالطَّاعَةِ فِي مَنْشَطِنَا وَأَنْ لَا تَنَازَعَ الْأَمْرَ أَهْلُهُ إِلَّا أَنْ تَرَوْا  
وَمَكَرْهِنَا وَعُسْرِنَا وَيُسْرِنَا وَأَثَرَةَ عَلَيْنَا كُفْرًا بَوَاحًا عِنْدَكُمْ مِنَ اللَّهِ فِيهِ بُرْهَانٌ

We oath to Prophet saw to keep hear and obidient to the leader trough in love or hate, hardness or easyness, and he insisted us never to revoke a certain bussiness out of the expert, exsept you actually seen *kufir* in him and tou have the evidence from Allah (*Muttafaq 'alaih*)

This clergies oppinion asure that in Islam *syara*’, the muslims forbide to choose their leader who is non-muslim based the consideration that choose the non-muslim to be their leader and bind the fellowship with them is worried will defend the in combating muslims.

The other oppinion of the different group of clergies is choose the non-muslim leader is unforbide. Relating to this oppinion, Kamil (2016) said:

Admitted that in some *fiqh*, there were some clergies who distinguish the public rights of non muslim (*dzimni*) in public leadership. ... In the first conctitution of Iran – which was enacted in 1907 (under the role of Qajar Dynasty [1786-1925]) – stated that although all Iranian has an equal right before the law, but in verse 58 restricting the right of non muslim to become a minister in the government. This position can only be approved for muslim Iranian.

But when it is studied further, that Islamic perspective is not correct. The reason is The refusal on the non muslim leadership based on the partial understanding the verses or hadith which distinguish it.

The explanation that be presented by Kamil (2016) and accompanied with the example in some verses of quran which be

often used as a base to refuse choosing non-muslim leader in our society, that is verse 5:51 and 2:120. The both of verses tend to refuse the non-muslim to be a public leader.

At least, those verses should be balanced (interpreted/compared) with the verses or hadiths of muslims and non-muslims public rights. In this case, Kamil (2016) exemplifying verse 60:8 which is affirming that the muslims be just and do good to anyone. So that, Kamil (2016) argued that based on the last interpretation, the conclusion is choose the good non-muslim as a public leader isn't a problem in Islam.

The similar argue that related to elect the leader by muslim people is presented by Nardiansyah Hosen, The *Rais Syuriah PCI Nahdlatul Ulama* of Australia-New Zealand who review verse 5:51 based on *Tafsir Ibnu Katsir* about the verse *asbabun nuzul*. Ibnu Katsir argued that the meaning of *awliya* in that verse is:

Allah forbade the servants who belief to take the *kufir* as their *awliya*, instead of the believers. The meaning of *awliya* in this verse is make fellowship with them, loyal, sincere and secreting love and opening the believers (*mukmin*) privacy to them (Hosen, 2016).

Recognition to the rights of non-muslim public leadership, in teaching or historical practise is morbid. In accordance with the principles of Islamic ethic that the act which is not harmful to the muslims, justice demand, *musawah* (commonality), *syura* (solve the problems peacefully) and *ihsan* demand (*birr*).

When Ibn Taimiyah said that the state being fair backed by Allah in spite of led by

a man who does not muslim and the despotic country isn't backed by Allah even if it is led by a muslim as according to him in *Dar al-Ifta wal irsyad* (Ibn. Taimiyah, 1977, XXVIII h. 253):

Trully Allah back the state being fair although *kufir* (its leader disbeliefs) and not back the despotic country even muslims (as its leader). The world can upright in integrating *kufir* and justice and it can not upright with gearing tyranny and islamic.

In here, Ibn Taimiyah insists that the requirement of a leader is fair without regard to religion are engaged. So, when we are confronted in the choice to choose non-muslim leader or not, if asked who is to be choosen between the muslim leader who unable to lead and non-muslim leader who able? The expected answer of course the answer which get over that question, that is the muslim leader who able to lead.

However, when some day it happens, the realistic answer is non-muslim leader who able to lead. Because choosing the non muslim leader among the muslim people is unforbade. It is rferred to two things: First, the leadership term in islamic law is the term which is not absolute (*almutaghayyirat*). Second, the prohibition of choosing the non-muslim leader is associated with the cause of with, which is when they (non-muslim) sacrilege to the muslims.

The most important thing we need to understand is when we lean our religion science and knowledge, in this case is Islam, then we must adhere to its main sources whic is the teach of *salafus-shalih* or we call it with four *madzhab* (*madzhab* which is following Imam Syafi'i, *madzhab* Imam

Malik bin Anas, *madzhab* Imam Abu Hanifah bin Nu'man bin Tsabit Al-Taimi Al-Kufi and *madzhab* Imam Ahmad ibn Hanbal) and do not mixing it, moreover just to get “the easiest” kinds. We need to

implement it in ourself because one of the hadiths said that a *tabi'in* clergy, Muhammad bin Sirin said:

إِنَّ هَذَا الْعِلْمَ دِينٌ فَانظُرُوا عَمَّنْ تَأْخُذُونَ دِينَكُمْ

This science is religy, so pay attention, where were you took your religion (narated by Muslim 26 and ad-Darimi 427). *Wallahu a'lam bish Shawab*.

#### D. CONCLUSION

Related to elect a leader for the mulims, there are some groups of clergies which dissented. On the one hand stated that the leader of the muslims is forbidden to be appointed from among non-muslim. They laid their oppinion on the interpretation of the strong verses and hadiths. And so did the others stated that choose the leader which be appointed from among non-muslim is unforbade.

In addressing the both of dissented, as a muslim who live in Indonesia as a plural country, especially in religy, we need to be wise to decide. The most important thing to understan is by based on beneficiaries for all citizens, there are general rules of *syara'*.

In addition, as muslims, we have to aware that when we lean our religion science and knowledge, in this case is Islam, then we must adhere to its main sources whic is the teach of *salafus-shalih* and do not mixing it, moreover just to get “the easiest” kinds.

#### REFERENCES

Al-Atsari, A. I. (2010) *Pemimpin Ideal*.

Retrieved in 20 November 2017 from <https://almanhaj.or.id/2728pemimpinideal.html>.

Al-Suyuti, A. (1403 H) *Al-Durar al-Mansur fi al-Tafsir al-Mansur*. jilid VII. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr.

Al-Wahidi, A. (1386 H). *Asbab al-Nuzul*. Jilid II. Mesir: Mustafa al-Bab al-Halabi.

Al-Suyuti, A. (1403 H). *Al-Durar al-Mansur fi al-Tafsir al-Mansur*. Volume VII. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr.

An-Nawawi (t.t.) *Rawdhah ath-Thalibin wa 'Umdah al-Muftin*. III/433.

\_\_\_\_\_. (t.t.) *Syarh Shahih Muslim*. VI/291.

Baits, A. N. (2015) *Hukum Memilih Pemimpin Kafir*. Retrieved in 12 November 2017 from: <https://konsultasisyariah.com/25986-hukum-memilih-pemimpin-kafir.html>.

Baqi, M. F. A. (2014) *Hadits Shahih Bukhari Muslim*. Depok: PT. Fathan Prima Media.

Faqih, A. A. (2009) *Haruskah Dakwah Merambah Kekuasaan?* Jakarta: Al-I'tishom.

Hosen, N. (2016) *Benarkah Dilarang Memilih Non-Muslim sebagai Pemimpin?* Retrieved in 12 November 2017 from <http://www.fiqhmenjawab.net/2016/03/2868/>.

Ibn. Taimiyah (1977) *Dar al-Ifta wal Irsyad*. Jilid. XXVIII. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr.

- Kamil, S. (2016) *Kepemimpinan Non-Muslim dalam Islam*. Retrieved in 12 November 2017 from: <http://www.uinjkt.ac.id/id/kepemimpinan-non-muslim-dalam-islam/>.
- Noor, I. (2011) *Manajemen Kepemimpinan Muhammad saw*. Bandung: Mizan.
- Rahim, A. (2012) Khalifah dan Khilafah Menurut Alquran. *Jurnal Studi Islamika*. Vol. 9 (1). hlm. 19-53.
- Robbins, S. P. (2003) *Essentials of Organization Behavior*. 7th Edition. New Jersey: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Schermerson Jr., et.al (2011) *Organizational Behavior*. Pennsylvania: John Welly & Son.
- Yukl, G. (2009) *Leadership in Organizations*. Sixth Edition. Delhi: Dorling Kindersley.

*MULYANA ABDULLAH, WILODATI, KAMA ABDULHAKAM, RATNA FITRIA/*  
The Perspective of Dienul-Islam in Reviewing Leadership for People