

The humanistic approach of PAI teachers in enhancing religious intelligence to mitigate bullying behavior among junior high school students

Hilman Taufiq Abdillah, Mayang Suri Purnama, Putri Anggraini Elmami, Salma Azahra, Sela Aprilia

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia

Corresponding author:

Hilman Taufiq Abdillah, email: hilmantaufiq88@upi.edu

Abstract. This study analyzes the role of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teachers in enhancing religious intelligence to mitigate bullying behavior at SMP Negeri 29 Bandung and MTs Al-Fattah Tunggilis through a humanistic approach. This humanistic approach integrates religious and moral values into the learning process to develop students' empathy, emotional control, and moral awareness. The research employs a mixed-method approach, combining both quantitative and qualitative methods through interviews and questionnaires with four PAI teachers and 110 students. The results show that humanistic-based teaching strategies, such as active learning and the internalization of religious values, effectively improve students' religious intelligence. The findings also indicate that students with higher religious intelligence tend to avoid bullying behavior. Therefore, the humanistic approach in PAI education can be an effective solution in creating a safer and more harmonious school environment.

Keywords: *Bullying, PAI Teachers, Religious Intelligence, Humanistic Approach, Junior High School.*

Abstrak. Penelitian ini menganalisis peran guru Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) dalam meningkatkan kecerdasan religius guna menanggulangi perilaku bullying di SMP Negeri 29 Bandung dan MTs Al-Fattah Tunggilis melalui pendekatan humanistik. Pendekatan humanistik ini mengintegrasikan nilai religius dan moral dalam proses pembelajaran untuk mengembangkan sikap empati, kontrol emosi, dan kesadaran moral siswa. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode campuran (mix method), yang mencakup metode kuantitatif dan kualitatif melalui wawancara dan kuesioner kepada empat guru PAI dan 110 siswa. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa strategi pembelajaran berbasis humanistik, seperti active learning dan internalisasi nilai-nilai keagamaan, efektif dalam meningkatkan kecerdasan religius siswa. Temuan ini juga mengindikasikan bahwa siswa dengan kecerdasan religius yang lebih tinggi cenderung menghindari perilaku bullying. Oleh karena itu, pendekatan humanistik dalam pembelajaran PAI dapat menjadi solusi yang efektif dalam menciptakan lingkungan sekolah yang aman dan harmonis.

Kata kunci: *Bullying, Guru PAI, Kecerdasan Religius, Pendekatan Humanistik, Sekolah Menengah Pertama.*

Article history:

Received
11 February 2025

Revised
08 April 2025

Accepted
18 April 2025

Available online
06 May 2025

Introduction

Adolescence is a crucial transitional stage in individual development, where behaviors are often influenced by the surrounding social environment (Amasda & Rahmayati, 2017; Andargini & Rivai, 2007). Adolescent behavior at this stage tends to vary, influenced by a high curiosity and the tendency to imitate things deemed interesting from family, friends, or the surrounding environment. Therefore, parental and educator support is essential to help adolescents distinguish right from wrong and avoid negative behaviors, including bullying (Misnani, 2016; Sugijokanto, 2014).

Bullying at the Junior High School (SMP) level remains a serious and ongoing issue in education. According to data from the Indonesian Child Protection Commission (KPAI), bullying occurs in 10-60% of students each week, manifested in teasing, exclusion, physical violence, or verbal abuse (Putri, 2022). In Indonesia, the rate of bullying is alarmingly high, with the country ranking second in bullying cases globally, just behind Japan (Sulis, 2015). While there has been a significant decline after the COVID-19 pandemic, bullying remains a pressing problem that needs to be addressed.

Previous studies have shown that bullying can cause serious psychological impacts on the victims, affecting their self-confidence and social interaction skills at school (Febriani, 2023). To combat this issue, character education based on religion, particularly Islamic Religious Education (PAI), is a relevant approach to reduce bullying behaviors. PAI teachers play a key role in internalizing spiritual values to shape students' characters, making them more caring and able to avoid negative behaviors (Huda & Khadavi, 2025).

The humanistic approach in PAI education, which focuses on holistic self-development, has proven to be effective in enhancing students' religious intelligence. Active learning methods and the integration of religious values into daily life can increase empathy, emotional control, and moral awareness in students, directly impacting the reduction of bullying behavior (Hidayat & Syarif, 2022). Moreover, Islam emphasizes the importance of emotional management as part of spiritual intelligence, with teachings that prioritize patience, empathy, and respect for others (HR. Bukhari & Muslim).

This study aims to analyze the application of the humanistic approach by PAI teachers in improving students' religious intelligence and its impact on reducing bullying behavior in schools. By integrating humanistic theory into the learning process, this research is expected to contribute significantly to the development of more effective educational methods in reducing bullying among adolescents.

Methods

This study uses a mixed-method approach, combining quantitative and qualitative methods, allowing for a more comprehensive understanding of the phenomenon being studied (Nugroho & Rahmawati, 2023). The research was conducted in two junior high schools: SMP Negeri 29 Bandung and MTs Al-Fattah Tunggal. The subjects of this study were 7th and 9th-grade students, as well as Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teachers at these schools. The research sample consisted of four PAI teachers and 110 students, selected using the stratified random sampling technique. The sample details are as follows: 50 students from SMP Negeri 29 Bandung, consisting of 30 students from grade 7 and 20 from grade 9, and 60 students from MTs Al-Fattah Tunggal, consisting of 32 students from grade 7 and 28 from grade 9. The stratified random sampling technique was chosen to ensure proportional representation from

each stratum in the population, reduce potential bias, and allow for a more in-depth analysis of the relationships between variables in the study (Setiawan, 2022).

Two main techniques were used for data collection: interviews and questionnaires. Interviews were conducted to gather qualitative data on the experiences and perspectives of PAI teachers regarding the implementation of the humanistic approach in reducing bullying behaviors and enhancing religious intelligence among students. These interviews provided deeper insights into the strategies employed by teachers during the learning process (Zuriah, 2009).

Questionnaires were used to measure the students' religious intelligence levels and their perceptions of the values instilled during the learning process. The questionnaires were divided into three main sections: (1) The humanistic approach of the PAI teacher, (2) Religious intelligence, and (3) Bullying behavior. A Likert scale of 1-5 was used to evaluate the respondents' agreement levels with each item measured (Kurniawan et al., 2020). The questionnaire was distributed to students at SMP Negeri 29 Bandung and MTs Al-Fattah Tunggilis to measure their religious intelligence, which includes dimensions such as spirituality, religious practice, social empathy, and moral awareness. This technique allowed for the collection of quantitative data for further analysis of the relationship between religious intelligence and bullying behavior.

The main research instrument consisted of a questionnaire with three sections:

1. Humanistic Approach of the PAI Teacher: 5 items measuring the role of the teacher as a spiritual guide, role model, learning facilitator, and builder of students' religious character.
2. Religious Intelligence: 5 items measuring the ability to recognize the meaning of life according to religious teachings, face difficulties with religious values, consistency in worship, and understanding of moral values.
3. Bullying Behavior: 5 items measuring verbal harm, physical harm, social exclusion, and intimidation. All items used a Likert scale of 1-5 to evaluate the respondents' agreement levels.

Quantitative data were obtained by distributing questionnaires to students to measure their religious intelligence and its impact on bullying behavior. The questionnaire consisted of two main sections:

1. Religious Intelligence Scale: Measuring the dimensions of students' religious understanding, practice, and attitudes.
2. Bullying Behavior Scale: Evaluating the frequency and types of bullying behaviors exhibited by students.

Data collection was carried out using a self-report approach, where students were asked to independently fill out the questionnaire, and the results were statistically analyzed to observe the relationship between religious intelligence and bullying behavior.

Additionally, qualitative data were collected through in-depth interviews with four PAI teachers to understand the strategies and implementation of the humanistic approach in teaching (Sari & Handayani, 2022).

Quantitative data were analyzed using descriptive statistics to describe the distribution and tendencies of the data. This analysis provides an overview of the relationship between students' religious intelligence levels and bullying behavior. Qualitative data were analyzed using content analysis, involving three main steps: (1) data reduction, (2) data presentation, and (3) conclusion

drawing (Fadilah, 2023). This approach was used to analyze the interviews with PAI teachers to identify themes related to the implementation of the humanistic approach in teaching.

Results and Discussion

Definition of Bullying

According to Tirmidziani et al. (2018), bullying comes from the word "bully," which means to harass or intimidate someone who is weaker. Bullying is a form of abuse of power or authority that occurs repeatedly in relationships, through verbal, physical, and social actions that cause both physical and psychological harm. Olweus (1993) defined bullying as actions of attacking or intimidating others physically, verbally, or psychologically that make the victim feel afraid, pressured, or harmed (Georgiou, 2007). Bullying perpetrators often view themselves as having power or control over their victims by continuously bullying them, which makes the victims feel powerless, weak, and constantly threatened.

Types of Bullying

Coloroso (2007) classified bullying into four types, which are:

- **Physical Bullying**
Physical bullying refers to acts of violence directed towards the victim's body, such as hitting, punching, slapping, scratching, biting, pushing, or even spitting on the victim. This form of bullying often occurs when the perpetrator is dissatisfied with verbal bullying and observes the victim's lack of significant emotional response. The perpetrator may perceive the victim as weaker, which facilitates physical aggression.
- **Verbal Bullying**
Verbal bullying is a form of oppression that involves hurtful words, mocking, or insulting someone using harsh and painful language. Initially, it may appear as jokes, but when repeated, it can make the victim feel ashamed, fearful, and worthless. Examples include mocking a person's parents, insulting physical appearance, slander, and using offensive language.
- **Relational Bullying**
Relational bullying is a form of behavior aimed at diminishing the victim's self-esteem by ostracizing, ignoring, and isolating them from the group. The perpetrator often uses sharp glances to show disapproval and manipulate others into excluding the victim.
- **Cyberbullying**
Cyberbullying is bullying conducted through social media. This type of bullying typically involves the use of photos, written content, or videos that are inappropriate, intimidating, and aimed at humiliating the victim.

Sample Description

This study was conducted at SMP Negeri 29 Bandung and MTs Al-Fattah Tunggilis. The subjects of this research were PAI teachers and 7th and 9th-grade students. The following table provides the sample description based on gender, grade level, and school type:

Variable	Category	Number of Students
Gender	Male	49
	Female	61
Grade Level	Grade 7	62
	Grade 9	48
School Type	MTs Al-Fattah Tunggalis	60
	SMPN 29 Bandung	50

Table 1: Sample Distribution Based on Gender, Grade Level, and School Type.

Table 1 shows the sample distribution across three main variables: gender, grade level, and school type. The sample consists of 110 students, with 61 females and 49 males. Most students are in grade 7 (62 students), followed by grade 9 (48 students). In terms of school type, most students attend MTs Al-Fattah Tunggalis (60 students), with the remaining 50 students attending SMPN 29 Bandung. This distribution demonstrates a balanced representation across gender, grade level, and school type in the sample.

Based on interviews with PAI teachers at MTs Al-Fattah Tunggalis, bullying cases at the school are not widespread but still exist, particularly among adolescents. Bullying often occurs in the form of teasing or jokes, and the victims are typically quiet students or those with cognitive limitations. When bullying cases arise, teachers immediately intervene by reprimanding the perpetrators, investigating the cause, and offering advice for behavior correction. The school has also conducted training on bullying prevention to better address these incidents. Furthermore, the school plans to organize a seminar on bullying prevention.

In Islamic Religious Education (PAI) classes, values such as empathy, love, and tolerance are emphasized. Teachers provide examples of good behavior, as children tend to imitate these actions. The school has a gradual approach to handling bullying, with the class teacher addressing initial incidents and involving the counseling teacher if necessary. Parental involvement is also crucial in addressing bullying and fostering mutual respect among students. Teachers promote creating a supportive learning environment while understanding student habits to prevent bullying. A positive learning environment allows students to feel safe, accepted, and valued, which reduces the likelihood of aggressive behavior like bullying. According to Ki Hajar Dewantara, the goal of education is not only to increase intelligence but also to form character and morals. Through the principle “*ing ngarso sung tulodho, ing madyo manguk karso, tut wuri handayani*,” teachers are expected to serve as role models, motivators, and moral supporters for their students (Dewantara, 2004).

Psychologically, it is essential for teachers to understand students' developmental stages to provide appropriate guidance. According to Erikson's psychosocial theory, grade 7 students are in the "identity vs. role confusion" phase, where they are searching for their identity and are often vulnerable to social pressures and role conflicts (Erikson, 1968). At this stage, they may become perpetrators or victims of bullying as they struggle to adapt to a new environment. This is in line with Sarlito W. Sarwono's (2002) statement that early adolescents often display aggressive behaviors as a reaction to emotional instability and a need for social recognition.

Bullying cases tend to be more prevalent in grade 7, as the transition from elementary to junior high school often causes anxiety and social discomfort. Students try to find their social

position in the new environment, sometimes resorting to unhealthy behaviors like bullying. In Bandura's social learning theory (1977), it is emphasized that violent behavior can be imitated through observation of dominant behavior models, both from peers and the surrounding environment. Therefore, teachers need to be role models by demonstrating positive behaviors and actively correcting deviations.

In contrast, grade 9 students tend to be less involved in bullying because they have developed emotionally and socially. They are generally in the conventional moral development stage according to Kohlberg's theory (1981), where their moral decisions are influenced by social norms and a desire to maintain harmony. Prof. Djaali (2007) also noted that towards the end of adolescence, students begin to control their emotions, understand others' perspectives, and act based on broader social considerations.

Understanding these stages, teachers should not only be educators but also character mentors. A humanistic approach in education, as emphasized by Muhaimin (2009), highlights the importance of empathy, dialogue, and appreciation for student diversity as strategies to create an inclusive environment free from bullying. Therefore, teachers' awareness and sensitivity to students' characteristics and habits are crucial in fostering a safe classroom environment and promoting positive social development.

Comparison of Survey Results between MTs Al-Fattah and SMPN 29 Bandung

The following is a comparative analysis of students from MTs Al-Fattah Tunggilis and SMPN 29 Bandung based on the survey results:

Aspect	MTs Al-Fattah (%) Agree or Strongly Agree	SMPN 29 (%) Agree or Strongly Agree
PAI teacher motivates students to be better individuals	85%	89%
PAI teacher instills empathy and concern	80%	84%
PAI teacher teaches religion with love	83%	87%
PAI teacher treats all students fairly	81%	85%
PAI teacher encourages freedom of expression	79%	82%

Table 2: Humanistic Approach of PAI Teacher

Aspect	MTs Al-Fattah (%) Agree or Strongly Agree	SMPN 29 (%) Agree or Strongly Agree
Doing good to others as a religious teaching	88%	92%
Respecting differences in beliefs and opinions	75%	80%
Understanding the consequences of actions according to religion	81%	85%

Striving to perform daily religious duties	78%	83%
Feeling closer to God after learning PAI	73%	80%

Table 3: Religious Intelligence

Aspect	MTs Al-Fattah (%) Agree or Strongly Agree	SMPN 29 (%) Agree or Strongly Agree
Avoiding mocking or degrading others	82%	86%
Acknowledging that bullying is not justified in religion	86%	90%
Feeling safe and comfortable at school	75%	83%
Having experienced unpleasant treatment from peers	35%	28%
Having witnessed peers being mocked or humiliated	45%	38%

Table 4: Bullying Behavior

The comparison results between MTs Al-Fattah Tunggilis and SMPN 29 Bandung show that students in both schools have a high appreciation for the role of PAI teachers in conveying religious values. However, there is a tendency that students at SMPN 29 Bandung give more positive feedback on the teaching methods used by their teachers. This suggests that the learning approach at SMPN 29 is more effective in building students' understanding and religious experiences. This finding aligns with Carl Rogers' (1983) humanistic approach, which states that teachers should act as facilitators who humanize students, create a supportive learning environment, and address their emotional and spiritual needs.

Furthermore, students at SMPN 29 Bandung showed a higher level of understanding and respect for religious values compared to students at MTs Al-Fattah. This finding supports the concept of religious intelligence, as proposed by Zohar and Marshall (2001), which includes the ability to find meaning in life based on spiritual values, face difficulties with strength of faith, and maintain moral consistency. Students who receive religious education through a reflective and contextual approach tend to be more effective in consistently implementing religious teachings in their daily behavior.

In terms of school environment comfort, students at SMPN 29 Bandung felt safer and experienced bullying less frequently compared to students at MTs Al-Fattah. This suggests that the social climate and emotional connection between teachers and students at SMPN 29 are more well-established, with more effective social control mechanisms. This finding aligns with Bronfenbrenner's social ecology theory, which states that microenvironments like schools have a significant influence on children's behavioral development. Schools that foster a positive school climate, ensure safety, and establish healthy interpersonal relationships among school members play a critical role in preventing negative behaviors, including bullying.

Therefore, efforts to enhance anti-bullying programs and strengthen humanistic-based teaching methods at MTs Al-Fattah are necessary. Teachers need to adopt more interactive teaching strategies that address the affective aspects of students, fostering empathy, moral

responsibility, and social solidarity. A comprehensive evaluation of the teaching system and school environment is an essential strategic effort to create a safe, comfortable, and conducive learning atmosphere for students' religious character development.

Conclusion

Based on the results of this study, it can be concluded that the humanistic approach in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) plays a significant role in enhancing students' religious intelligence and reducing bullying behavior in junior high schools. PAI teachers, acting as facilitators, spiritual guides, and role models for students, are able to create a more inclusive, empathetic, and value-based learning environment. The implementation of active learning in PAI education has proven to be effective in enhancing students' understanding of religious teachings and their application in everyday life. This is consistent with the interview results, which show that students with higher religious intelligence tend to be more empathetic, have better emotional control, and avoid bullying behavior. This study also emphasizes that the combination of quantitative and qualitative methods provides a more comprehensive picture of the relationship between religious intelligence, the humanistic approach, and bullying behavior. Data obtained from questionnaires and interviews indicate that students receiving PAI education with a humanistic approach are more capable of understanding the negative impacts of bullying and actively avoiding such behavior. Therefore, it is important for schools and educators, particularly PAI teachers, to continue developing anti-bullying programs and strengthen more interactive teaching methods, as well as strategies that emphasize humanistic aspects and religious values. Additionally, cooperation between teachers, parents, and the school is essential in building students' religious character to create a safe, comfortable, and bullying-free educational environment.

References

- Arikunto, S. (2019). *Prosedur Penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Praktik*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- Bandura, A. (1977). *Social Learning Theory*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Chairul Umam, M. (2019). Implementasi Teori Belajar Humanistik Carl R. Rogers Pada Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Tadrib: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 5(2).
- Coloroso, B. (2007). *The Bully, The Bullied, and The Bystander*. New York: HarperCollins.
- Dewantara, K. H. (2004). *Pendidikan: Pemikiran, Konsep, dan Keteladanan Ki Hadjar Dewantara*. Yogyakarta: Majelis Luhur Persatuan Tamansiswa.
- Djaali. (2007). *Psikologi Perkembangan*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Erikson, E. H. (1968). *Identity: Youth and Crisis*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.
- Fadilah, M. (2023). Metode Analisis Kualitatif dalam Penelitian Pendidikan. *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan*, 5(2), 100-115.
- Febriani, R. (2023). Peran Guru PAI dalam Mencegah Perilaku Bullying di Sekolah Menengah. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(1), 45-60.
- Georgiou, S. (2007). The Influence of Bullying on Mental Health. *Journal of School Psychology*, 6(1), 22-38. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jsp.2007.01.001>
- Hidayat, A., & Syarif, M. (2022). Implementasi Active Learning dalam Pembelajaran PAI di MTsN 1 Bombana. *Jurnal Keislaman*, 6(4), 130-145.
- Ismail, F. (2014). *Valuasi Pendidikan*. Tunas Gemilang Press.

- Muchlis Solichin, M. (2018). Teori Belajar Humanistik Dan Aplikasinya Dalam Pendidikan Agama Islam: Telaah Materi Dan Metode Pembelajaran. *Islamuna: Jurnal Studi Islam*, 5(1).
- Nasirudin, A., & Putra, I. M. (2024). Teori Belajar Humanistik Dalam Pembelajaran PAI. *JoEMS (Journal of Education and Management Studies)*, 7(3), 110-115.
- Huda, M. M., & Khadavi, M. J. (2025). Peran Guru PAI dalam Mencegah Perilaku Bullying di SMP Muhammadiyah 1 Probolinggo. *ISLAMIKA*, 7(1), 124-140. <https://doi.org/10.36088/islamika.v7i1.5496>
- Kohlberg, L. (1981). *The Philosophy of Moral Development: Moral Stages and the Idea of Justice*. San Francisco: Harper & Row.
- Kurniawan, R., Putra, D., & Lestari, P. (2020). Penggunaan Skala Likert dalam Penelitian Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Jurnal Metodologi Pendidikan*, 8(2), 75-90.
- Muhaimin. (2009). *Strategi Belajar Mengajar*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Muslich, M. (2020). Pendidikan Karakter Berbasis Nilai-Nilai Islam dalam Pembentukan Kecerdasan Spiritual Siswa. *Jurnal Tarbiyah dan Pendidikan*, 7(1), 45–59.
- Mutiasari, H., & Yarni, L. (2023). Fenomena Bullying dalam Kalangan Siswa di SMP Negeri 1 Tara. *Jurnal Kajian Penelitian Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan*, 1(1), 72-86.
- Nugroho, A., & Rahmawati, I. (2023). Pendekatan Mix Method dalam Studi Pendidikan Islam. *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Islam*, 9(1), 32-50.
- Ramadhan, A., Susanti, H., & Jannah, R. (2021). Kecerdasan Religius dan Pencegahan Perilaku Bullying di SMP Negeri 2 Makassar. *Jurnal Pendidikan Karakter*, 10(3), 56-72.
- Rogers, C. R. (1983). *Freedom to Learn for the 80s*. Charles Merrill Publishing Company.
- Sari, T., & Handayani, D. (2022). Strategi Guru PAI dalam Meningkatkan Kecerdasan Spiritual Siswa. *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Karakter*, 11(2), 90-105.
- Sari, D., & Handayani, A. (2022). Pendekatan Humanistik dalam Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 10(1), 55–67.
- Sarwono, S. W. (2002). *Psikologi Remaja*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.
- Setiawan, B. (2022). Teknik Stratified Random Sampling dalam Penelitian Pendidikan. *Jurnal Statistik Pendidikan*, 7(4), 145-160.
- Source online: <https://bankdata.kpai.go.id/tabulasi-data/data-perlindungan-anak-2024> accessed on March 28, 2025.
- Source online: <https://www.kpai.go.id/publikasi/kpai-presiden-jokowi-siapkan-perpres-terkait-bullying-terhadap-anak> accessed on March 28, 2025.
- Sugiyono. (2021). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan: Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D* (12th ed.). Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Tirmidziani, A., Farida, N. S., Lestari, R. F., Trianita, R., Khoerunnisa, S., & Khomaeny, E. F. F. (2018). Upaya Menghindari Bullying Pada Anak Usia Dini Melalui Parenting. *Early Childhood: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 2(1), 59–65. <https://doi.org/10.35568/earlychildhood.v2i1.239>
- Tiwa, T. M. (2023). Analisis Perilaku Sosial Remaja Korban Bullying Pada Siswa SMP Negeri 2 Tondano Minahasa Sulawesi Utara. *Jurnal Cahaya Mandalika*, 4(2), 158-165. <https://doi.org/10.36312/jcm.v4i2.1446>
- Toha, S. M. (2018). Pelaksanaan Metode Active Learning dalam Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa pada Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Ta'dibuna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(1), 79-93.

- Wahyuni, E. (2021). Instrumen Penelitian dalam Studi Keislaman: Kuesioner dan Validitasnya. *Jurnal Keislaman dan Pendidikan*, 12(1), 20-35.
- Wahyuni, S. (2021). Pengembangan Instrumen Penelitian Pendidikan. Yogyakarta: Deepublish.
- Zaman, B. (2020). Penerapan Active Learning dalam Pembelajaran PAI. *Jurnal As-Salam*, 4(1), 13-27.
- Zohar, D., & Marshall, I. (2001). *Spiritual Intelligence: The Ultimate Intelligence*. Bloomsbury Publishing.